



European
Commission



SUSTAINABLE INCLUSION OF MIGRANTS INTO SOCIETY AND LABOUR MARKET

*Employment,
Social Affairs
and Inclusion*

LEGAL NOTICE

Manuscript completed in June 2019

Neither the European Commission nor any person acting on behalf of the European Commission is responsible for the use that might be made of the following information. More information on the European Union is available on the Internet (<http://www.europa.eu>).

Luxembourg: Publications Office of the European Union, 2019

PDF ISBN 978-92-76-08677-2 doi: 10.2767/42969

KE-02-19-483-EN-N

© European Union, 2019

The information contained in this publication does not necessarily reflect the official position of the European Commission
This document has received financial support from the European Union Programme for Employment and Social Innovation "EaSI" (2014-2020). For further information please consult: <http://ec.europa.eu/social/easi>

Reuse is authorised provided the source is acknowledged. The reuse policy of European Commission documents is regulated by Decision 2011/833/EU (OJ L 330, 14.12.2011, p. 39). For any use or reproduction of photos or other material that is not under the EU copyright, permission must be sought directly from the copyright holders.

Images: © Shutterstock (cover), RIAC project (pp. 5, 7, 11), KOTO-SIB project (p.14) and iStock (p.22).

SUSTAINABLE INCLUSION OF MIGRANTS INTO SOCIETY AND LABOUR MARKET



JUNE 2019



CONTENTS

Foreword by the Commissioner	4
1 Introduction	5
1.1 European policy context regarding migrant inclusion into society and labour market	5
2 Moving towards integrated approaches and mainstreaming services for migrant inclusion	7
2.1 Key elements of the integrated approach	7
2.2 Models of policies and practices in Member States	9
3 EU Funding for inclusion of migrants	11
3.1 Current practices related to the various funding streams	11
3.2 Opportunities related to the future design of EU Funds	12
4 New tools and initiatives within the integrated approach	14
4.1 Improving evaluation tools to strengthen evidence based-approaches	14
4.2 Sustainable labour market inclusion initiatives	16
4.3 Education and skills for the inclusion of migrants	17
4.4 Social inclusion of the most vulnerable migrants	18
5 Conclusion and key policy messages	22
5.1 Lessons learned and conclusions	22
5.2 Key policy messages	23

FOREWORD BY THE COMMISSIONER



Marianne Thyssen

European Commissioner for Employment,
Social Affairs, Skills and Labour Mobility

When the European Commission started five years ago, we set out an agenda on migration. Confronted with an unprecedented refugee crisis, we took steps to save lives at sea, protect our borders against irregular immigration, address the root causes of migration, fight smugglers and create legal pathways for a well-managed migration.

Thanks to these efforts, irregular arrivals have dropped by 90 per cent compared to 2015, over 700 000 illegal third country nationals have been returned, and the number of asylum applications has dropped to pre-crisis levels.

For those faced with threats to their lives and the welfare of their children, for those fleeing conflict or famine, it is our moral and legal obligation to offer them sanctuary. But ensuring a safe haven is only the first step. For a cohesive society, we need those that do stay in the EU – refugees, migrants, and their children – to participate fully in economic, cultural and social life. In an inclusive society, we cannot leave anyone behind.

As Europe ages, and its labour market faces skills shortages and a shrinking workforce, migration, if properly managed, can be part of a wider strategy to address demographic ageing and can support the sustainability of our social security and pension systems. The key is ensuring migrant inclusion into the labour market and society, for men and women. Because integration is a two-way process, in full respect of European values.

Of course, integration will cost time, effort and money, but doing nothing would cost more. Effective integration policies are an investment, not an expense. An investment that pays dividends for the economy and for society.

An integrated approach to migrant inclusion is the idea behind our 2016 action plan on integration. It is also in line with the thinking behind the European Pillar of Social Rights. The Pillar acts as a compass towards upwards convergence, helping us navigate economic and social policies in these changing times and fostering more inclusive and resilient societies.

An integrated approach includes learning from each other and working together. Coordinating the efforts of Member States in the European Semester, as well as working closely with social partners and civil society, including migrants themselves, to help migrants and refugees get the education and skills they need and integrate fully into the labour market.

An integrated approach also means service integration. To get a job, people need to learn the language, but they also need a home, childcare and schooling. Maybe also psychological support, after the horrors of war and escape. For this, we need client-oriented social services that are well coordinated and work together.

The Commission also supports service integration through its Funds. The European Social Fund can help migrants validate or improve their skills, get a job or start a business. The Fund for European Aid to the most Deprived covers the basic needs of the most vulnerable people, including undocumented migrants. The Employment and Social Innovation Programme invests in several innovative projects that support fast-track integration of refugees and their families.

Together we can make every euro we spend on Social count, and ensure the inclusion of migrants is an opportunity for our society that will not be missed!



1. INTRODUCTION

1.1. European policy context regarding migrant inclusion into society and labour market

Labour market inclusion of migrants¹ depends on labour market conditions and regulations on the one hand and supply-side factors, such as skills and qualifications of migrants, on the other hand. In 2018, 22.3 million third-country nationals (TCNs) were living in the European Union (4.4% of the total EU population).² While they are generally younger than European Union (EU) nationals (78% were aged between 15-65 years old in 2018), only 58% of the population aged 20-64 are active in the labour market. The overall employment rate of migrants (67% in 2017) differs from the native-born population (73%).³ In addition, family reunion migrants and refugees face worse labour market outcomes than people who migrated to work or study. Besides lacking sufficient language skills, limitations to utilise existing qualifications and skills, cultural differences and discrimination, refugees and asylum seekers often face addi-

tional barriers to enter the labour market, such as legal obstacles, health issues or mental health problems.

Almost 25% of migrants are highly educated, however over 40% are overqualified for the job they do. While, in general, highly educated migrants tend to have a higher employment rate, however, formal education alone does not guarantee inclusion into the labour market. For instance, employment outcomes are particularly negative for highly educated migrants with foreign qualifications that are not fully recognised in the host country. On the other hand, 20% of migrants have a very low level of education, which may mean that their potential might be wasted. Besides factors such as limited (or lack of) knowledge of the host country language and difficulties in obtaining recognition for existing diplomas, a lack of access to childcare services as well as discrimination issues, mean that third-country nationals meet more difficulties, not only in finding employment, but also in getting access to education and housing.⁴

1 This report uses the terminology derived from the glossary of the European Migration Network (EMN). Third-country national (TCN): any person who is not a citizen of the Union within the meaning of Art. 20(1) of TFEU and who is not a person enjoying the European Union right to free movement, as defined in Art. 2(5) of the Regulation (EU) 2016/399 (Schengen Borders Code). *Migrant*: a TNC who establishes their usual residence in the territory of an EU/EFTA Member State for a period that is, or is expected to be, of at least 12 months, having previously been usually resident in a third country.

2 Eurostat, Migrant integration statistics – labour market indicators, https://ec.europa.eu/eurostat/statistics-explained/index.php?title=Migrant_integration_statistics

3 Ibid, https://ec.europa.eu/eurostat/statistics-explained/index.php/Migrant_integration_statistics_%E2%80%93_labour_market_indicators

4 OECD (2016). Towards a framework for fair and effective integration of migrants into the labour market. Accessed at:

Over the past years, the unprecedented influx of migrants has posed significant challenges to Member States trying to develop policies aimed at including migrants into the labour market and social life. Over almost two decades, the inclusion of migrants into labour markets and society has been one of the main priorities of EU policy. A broad range of programmes and financial instruments have been put in place by the EU to support Member States in facilitating migrants' inclusion.

Labour market inclusion is one of the key areas addressed by EU policies; it is fundamental to becoming part of the host country's economic and social life. Changing circumstances, such as fluctuations in the size or nature of migrant groups, changes in EU societies and their economies, the long-term nature of the inclusion process, need to be taken into consideration when designing and developing policies in this area. In particular, in order to make labour market inclusion policies "future-proof", it is important to look ahead and understand the wider-trends shaping the world of work and prepare for future challenges.

In light of the ageing of European societies, an effective inclusion of migrants into national labour markets would contribute to the sustainability of national welfare systems. Today there are 3.3 people of working age for every pensioner. If the current trend of a shrinking workforce persists, the ratio will decrease to being two to one in 2070, resulting in an increasing pressure on social security and pension systems.⁵

Lastly, inclusion measures require resources which can put pressure on public spending; however, the cost of non-inclusion is even more significant. Effective inclusion policies should be seen as an investment, not a cost.

http://www.ilo.org/wcmsp5/groups/public/---europe/---ro-geneva/---ilo-berlin/documents/genericdocument/wcms_556988.pdf

⁵ European Commission, 2018, The 2018 Ageing Report: Economic and Budgetary Projections for the EU Member States (2016-2070), accessed at https://ec.europa.eu/info/sites/info/files/economy-finance/ip079_en.pdf



2. MOVING TOWARDS INTEGRATED APPROACHES AND MAINSTREAMING SERVICES FOR MIGRANT INCLUSION

2.1 Key elements of the integrated approach

While integration policy is under the competence of the Member States, EU institutions have a long-standing record of providing support and incentives for national governments, local authorities and civil society engaged in the process of achieving inclusion and social cohesion. The EU acquis on legal migration provides for equal treatment of migrants with EU nationals in terms of working conditions, while the EU acquis on asylum contains specific provisions for beneficiaries of international protection.

The Common Agenda for Integration,⁶ adopted by the European Commission in 2005, provided a framework for the implementation of inclusion policies across the EU and a series of supportive mechanisms and instruments at EU level to promote integration and facilitate exchanges between the main actors involved.

This holistic and coordinated approach involving all relevant actors, together with the focus on mainstreaming migrants' inclusion into relevant policy areas at different governance levels, is fostered by the EU through several policy documents, such as for example the Common Basic Principles for Immigrants Integration Policy in the EU (2004). The European Commission presented its European Agenda on Migration in 2015, a comprehensive and cross-cutting policy response to tackle the challenges posed by migration while reaping its benefits, as well as providing answers to address the challenges specifically arising from the refugee crisis.⁷

Furthermore, an Action Plan on the integration of TCNs was presented in 2016. This Action Plan provides a common policy framework with supporting measures which aim to help Member States in developing and strengthening their national inclusion policies for TCNs (including some actions specifically targeted at the inclusion of refugees).

⁶ European Commission, 2005. A Common Agenda for Integration Framework for the Integration of Third-Country Nationals in the European Union. Accessed at <https://eur-lex.europa.eu/legal-content/EN/TXT/HTML/?uri=CELEX:52005DC0389&from=en>

⁷ COM(2015) 240 final. Communication from the Commission to the European Parliament, the Council, the European Economic and Social Committee and the Committee of the Regions. A European Agenda on Migration. Accessed at: https://ec.europa.eu/anti-trafficking/sites/antitrafficking/files/communication_on_the_european_agenda_on_migration_en.pdf

The Action Plan acknowledges that inclusion is a dynamic, multidimensional process which requires a cross-cutting approach. Indeed, inclusion policies must encompass a wide range of areas to succeed such as education, skills, employment, housing, healthcare, childcare, schooling and psychological support. In recent years, in addition to developing comprehensive reception services responding to the basic short-term needs as a consequence of an increased influx of asylum seekers,⁸ several Member States have started to redesign their approaches to support a longer-term perspective. In practice, this means setting up an integrated approach to the delivery of services to migrants starting at arrival in the host country through to all the phases and aspects related to their long-term inclusion.

Supporting migrants to get access to mainstreamed services is an important element of the integrated approach. At the same time service providers must adopt non-discrimination and diversity policies.

The mainstreaming approach is also at the centre of the European Pillar of Social Rights which foresees broad policies that help vulnerable groups, including migrants, to access employment, to have adequate income support and to have access to high quality social services. According to the comparative overview of Member States' labour market integration approaches prepared by the European Migration Network (EMN), eight countries have a mainstream approach (Austria, Germany, Ireland, Luxembourg, the Netherlands, Spain, Sweden and the United Kingdom). In some countries, such as Sweden, the mainstreaming approach is combined with a more targeted approach.⁹

Designing and implementing an integrated approach requires effective coordination among stakeholders at various levels to avoid duplication of services and to create synergies to deliver client-oriented services. In some cases, the coordination among the main actors can go further and take the shape of "one-stop shops" where different service providers are under the same roof. In addition, integrated approaches allow for a better uptake of the available services, and can be more

cost-efficient overall as also reiterated in March 2019 in the progress report on the implementation of the European Agenda on Migration.¹⁰

The EU supports labour market and social inclusion through several funding instruments, such as the European Social Fund (ESF), the Fund for European Aid to the most Deprived (FEAD) and by investing in several innovative projects to support fast-track inclusion of refugees and their families through the Employment and Social Innovation (EaSI) programme, which funds projects such the Regional Integration Accelerators (RIAC) as illustrated by the example below:

The Regional Integration Accelerators (RIAC) (2018-2020, €2.5 million)

The Regional Integration Accelerators project (RIAC), is an innovative project funded by EaSI. RIAC aims to encourage the inclusion of refugees into the European labour market with an accelerated and sustainable approach. It supports the development, testing and dissemination of a scalable approach for the fast-track integration of refugees. The project focuses on increase of employability of refugees and elimination of gender-specific differences, and includes long-term and comprehensive training and practices for promoting employment and entrepreneurship of refugees. The project consists of a total of eight partners from Denmark, Germany, Italy, and Turkey. Each partner contributes to the collective and sustainable implementation of the project, focusing on one main theme.

The mechanism and success factors will be disseminated at the European level.

In an integrated approach, coordination of measures and services should encompass also social partners and civil society. As a result, the European Commission has focussed on strengthening cooperation with social partners for the inclusion of migrants into the labour market. In this regard, two initiatives were launched in 2017: the "Employers together for integration"¹¹ initiative, aiming to give visibility to what employers are doing to support

8 European Migration Network, 2018. Changing Influx of Asylum Seekers 2014-2016. Accessed at: https://ec.europa.eu/home-affairs/sites/homeaffairs/files/00_eu_changing_influx_study_synthesis_final_en_0.pdf.

9 Bevelander, P. (2019) One Size Fits All? Integration approaches for beneficiaries of international protection.

10 COM (2019) 126 final, Communication from the Commission to the European Parliament, the European Council and the Council. Progress report on the Implementation of the European Agenda on Migration.

11 The "Employers together for integration": <https://ec.europa.eu/home-affairs/what-we-do/policies/>

the inclusion of refugees and other migrants into the labour market, and the “European Partnership for Integration”¹² that offers opportunities for refugees and migrants legally residing in the EU to integrate in the labour market. To be more effective, these innovative partnerships might be strengthened in Member States by involving the private sector further, which is a crucial multiplier needed to obtain successful outcomes related to labour market integration.

The European Commission also promotes dialogue with civil society organisations, who are often the actors most trusted by migrants. The latest strategic dialogue with civil society networks on the inclusion of migrants, that took place in March 2019 in Brussels, confirmed the need for a holistic, integrated approach to migrant inclusion, synergies among funds and a targeted approach for the most vulnerable migrants, such as women and children.

2.2 Models of policies and practices in Member States

Approaches to integration of migrants vary across the Member States and depend on several elements, such as historical migration patterns, intensity of migratory fluxes, government and institutional structure, and welfare and labour market models.

Integration policies can be categorised in different ways. For instance, according to a recent study,¹³ these policies have been classified according to the level of national and local authorities’ involvement and direction ranging from a national government-led model to a project based/multilevel governance model, a laissez-faire model, and an NGO-led model. Independently of the model applied, other features determine the inclusion policies adopted by a country. The participation in inclusion programmes can be voluntary or mandatory, service delivery can be targeted or mainstreamed, and the responsibilities between different government levels can be different as well as the number and type of stakeholders involved.

Different models can include:

National government-led model

Examples of national government-led models are provided in Scandinavian countries, where “introduction programmes” lasting two or three years and including language training, civic orientation and other measures to ease access to the labour market are foreseen for persons granted international protection. These programmes rely on efforts both from the national level (funding and services) and local level (services) with the involvement of civic organisations and social partners. While in Norway and Denmark participation in these programmes may affect the assessment of future applications for permanent residence, in Sweden participation is seen only as an entitlement. This model often uses local and regional agreements to improve the collaboration with important stakeholders, such as the employment services, municipalities, universities and NGOs. While the main advantage of this model is access to services and resources for newcomer migrants, the downsides have been found to be high cost, the slow pace of the labour market inclusion and that only few measures introduced proved to be effective.

Project based/multi-level governance model

In a project based/multi-level governance model, inclusion measures are project-based and developed at the local and regional level. The measures can include language courses, competence checks, mentoring programmes and apprenticeship placement. These project-based responses have been implemented mostly by Austria and Germany. For instance, in Germany most of the Bundesländer (federal states) and local governments have launched their own programmes in response to the refugee crisis. Even though in this model the national level is not as predominant as in the national government-led model, over time there has been an increasing involvement of the national level as a way to improve coordination and provide a national strategic approach. Being implemented mainly at the local level, the measures are targeted to respond to local needs and thus lead to varying outcomes in service delivery.

legal-migration/european-dialogue-skills-and-migration/integration-pact_en

¹² The “European Partnership for Integration”: http://europa.eu/rapid/press-release_IP-17-5352_en.htm

¹³ Bevelander, P. (2019) One Size Fits All? Integration approaches for beneficiaries of international protection.

Laissez-faire model

In the laissez-faire model, the national level involvement is limited. This approach is followed in Italy, the Netherlands and the United Kingdom. In Italy, the government has slowly moved from an emergency approach to a more structured approach, providing tailored support to migrants, however services are mostly dependent on cooperation between local governments and NGOs. In the Netherlands, most public inclusion services have been transferred to private companies, and Dutch municipalities can choose which type of assistance to provide. Also, the United Kingdom adopted this model in 2010, stepping back from a national inclusion strategy and starting to fund small, mul-

ti-level governance projects with NGOs and local government. The main weakness of this model is the difficulty of maintaining common standards of quality and consistency in service provision.

NGO model

In the NGO model, there are no specific resources or infrastructure for inclusion on either the local, regional, or national government level. In countries that follow this approach, NGOs are the main service providers for the inclusion of migrants, mainly using EU funds, especially the Asylum, Migration and Integration Fund (AMIF). This model is predominant in Central-Eastern European Member States.





3. EU FUNDING FOR INCLUSION OF MIGRANTS

3.1. Current practices related to the various funding streams

Since addressing migrants' inclusion requires a cross-cutting approach, the EU provides support to Member States in this area, through a number of funding instruments. Moreover, throughout the current Programming Period 2014-2020, the Commission increased the resources available to Member States to tackle the effect of the migration crisis. For instance, the allocation of the Asylum, Migration and Integration Fund (AMIF) was doubled and, as stated in the European Agenda for Migration, at least 20% of ESF resources can also be used to foster social inclusion, which includes measures for the integration of migrants with a particular focus on refugees and those seeking asylum, as well as on children.

Besides AMIF and ESF, Member States can make use of several other EU funding schemes contributing to the inclusion of migrants: EaSI, European Regional Development Fund, the European Agricultural Fund for Rural Development (EARDF), the European Maritime and Fisheries Fund (EMFF), the ERASMUS+ Programme, the Europe for Citizens Programme and the Creative Europe Programme which supports Refugee Integration Projects.¹⁴ The

Commission is actively working with all relevant stakeholders to ensure that all funding sources available are used to their maximum potential and in an integrated and strategically coordinated way.

Coordination is crucial to ensure that resources are directed to sustainable initiatives and that effective synergies among EU and national funds are built. An integrated approach plays a pivotal role in optimising and reinforcing synergies among different funds.

By designing evidence-based policies for migrant inclusion, Member States will be better positioned to identify priorities and devise future strategic policy frameworks at the national level, which will guide the contributions of all stakeholders. At the same time, it will while ensure a coordinated approach which will allow them to make better use of the existing resources. Focus should be given to adopting a sustainable approach to inclusion rather than to only funding specific one-off projects.

In line with the partnership principle, through vertical and horizontal coordination, Member States are encouraged to adopt a multi-level governance approach whereby national and local authorities, in cooperation with civil society and social partners,

¹⁴ https://eacea.ec.europa.eu/creative-europe/actions/refugee-integration-projects_en

could better align their funding to overall policy objectives.

Multi-stakeholder approach in practice – Speeding up integration of the most vulnerable migrants – Fast track Integration in European Regions (FIER), Austria, Belgium, Germany, Norway, Sweden and Turkey (2018-2020, €2.4 million)

With the EaSI-funded FIER project, European regions and partners from Austria, Belgium, Germany, Norway, Sweden and Turkey exchange and jointly develop strategies to support inclusion of the most vulnerable migrants through both dedicated instruments for a fast labour market access and instruments promoting social and economic cohesion. The consortium intends to step up current efforts to enhance inclusion and will further develop these strategies – aiming at quicker and more effective results on the ground.

The FIER project also put into practice a multi-stakeholder approach to labour market integration by creating and developing cooperation between public authorities, in particular the Public Employment Service (PES) and regional/local authorities, education and training providers, non-governmental organisations, refugee organisations and employers.

National and regional managing authorities of European Structural and Investment Funds can also play a crucial role in fostering synergies at the national level. To support local authorities and service providers in securing the appropriate co-financing for their projects, managing authorities could issue joint calls for different funds, grouped under similar objectives. Moreover, managing authorities could enhance coordination by harmonising the selection criteria across different calls as well as sequencing them so that thematically similar calls are released at the same time. As a result, it would be easier for local authorities and service providers to pool different funding streams together which it is necessary to implement larger projects.

An additional way to further support the optimisation of available funds is through existing European networks such as Eurocities. Through their work, local authorities – at the forefront in providing services to migrants – can discuss, refine and share pilot practices across Member States. Moreover, promising local practices can be disseminated at European level, encouraging the scale-up of such practices beyond national borders.

Scaling up local practices at the European level – WIR project, Austria, Finland, Germany, Italy, Latvia, Spain and Sweden (2017-2019, €150 000)

The EU funded project *Welcome and Integration Process for Refugees in Europe* (WIR) enabled a promising practice developed in a refugee camp in Restad Gård in Sweden to scale up, through the Support Group Network (SGN), which led to similar activities being delivered in various Member States. Created in 2014, the SGN brought together the efforts of associations and individuals aiming to help and support migrants to integrate into the host country. Through a participative approach, migrants were encouraged to use their knowledge and skills to provide services to their peers. As a result, migrants felt valued and empowered while practicing their own skills. In 2015, more than 900 activities were organised by the refugees themselves, providing direct services to 16 000 persons. In 2016, SGNs have been established in 16 other refugee camps in Sweden. In 2017, the WIR project conducted a cycle of dissemination activities, that led to the piloting of a similar approach in also beyond the project itself such as in France and Norway.

3.2. Opportunities related to the future design of EU Funds

Building on the Common Provisions Regulation,¹⁵ the Commission's proposal on the future Multiannual Financial Framework (MFF) 2021-2027 will prioritise streamlining and simplifying access to EU funds in the area of inclusion. In turn, this simplification will allow better synergies at the national level as it will be easier to pool funds and

¹⁵ Regulation (EU) No 1303/2013, Regulation of the European Parliament and the Council laying down common provisions on the European Regional Development Fund, the European Social Fund, the Cohesion Fund, the European Agricultural Fund for Rural Development and the European Maritime and Fisheries Fund and laying down general provisions on the European Regional Development Fund, the European Social Fund, the Cohesion Fund and the European Maritime and Fisheries Fund and repealing Council Regulation (EC) No 1083/2006.

reduce the administrative burden on beneficiaries. ESF+ aims to contribute to the simplification and coherence of the EU funding architecture as it is expected to merge together various funds and programmes, namely ESF, the Youth Employment Initiative (YEI), FEAD, EaSI as well as Health Programme.¹⁶ Moreover, clear distinctions have been proposed between the various funding instruments. AMIF, which is set to become the Asylum and Migration Fund (AMF) aims to focus on early inclusion measures and programmes mostly implemented in the first years after settlement in the EU.¹⁷ It is proposed that ESF+ would reinforce complementarity with AMF for all measures related to the employment and labour market integration of migrants and TCNs. Other thematic interventions in the areas of housing, culture and health are aimed to be financed by specific funds, such as ERDF, ERASMUS+, and EARDF.

Both AMF and ESF+ funds aim at increasing flexibility for Member States as well as encouraging them to adopt integrated approaches whilst, at the same time, facilitating funding for local and regional authorities as well as NGOs. For instance, according to the MFF proposal, through AMF, Member States will have the possibility to include new target groups, such as immediate relatives of TCNs, to the extent that their involvement is necessary for the effective implementation of inclu-

sion measures. Similarly, it is under discussion that ESF+ could be used to support labour integration measures for migrants, provided that they have legal status. Moreover, regardless of their status or whether they have access to the labour market, migrants will have access to social measures such as community-based services and health services, social inclusion measures as well as food and basic material assistance. Furthermore, all children (including migrant children) will be able to benefit from measures promoting access to quality and inclusive education.

In addition, it is planned that ESF+ would maintain the mainstreaming approach of its predecessor towards migrant inclusion to avoid the creation of a separate track for labour market inclusion which might not be effective and sustainable in the long run.

Finally, increased funds will be available for Member States to target migrants in the proposal for the next Multiannual Financial Framework. For instance, the AMF proposal for 2021-2027 is to triple its original allocation up to 10,415 billion, while 25% of ESF+ resources are to be allocated to foster social inclusion, including at least 2% to be reserved to address extreme forms of poverty and social exclusion.

.....
16 COM(2018) 382 final, Regulation of the European Parliament and the Council on the European Social Fund Plus (ESF+).

17 COM (2018) 471 final, Regulation of the European Parliament and the Council establishing the Asylum and Migration Fund.



4. NEW TOOLS AND INITIATIVES WITHIN THE INTEGRATED APPROACH

4.1. Improving evaluation tools to strengthen evidence based-approaches

An overview of recent research and other relevant sources¹⁸ highlights that, whilst the European Commission and other EU level institutions and organisations (e.g. European Parliament, Eurofound, EMN and Eurocities) and many international organisations (e.g. OECD, ILO, IMF, IOM and UNHCR) undertake studies on labour market integration of migrants, these tend to be labour market information mapping studies, or policy stocktakes. Other sources, including independent research, were found to relate to immigrants' characteristics, the policies and reactions of host societies and on the interactions of the two. Evaluations however, in their strictest interpretation (i.e. measuring the outcomes of legislation, policies, programmes etc.) were found to be relatively few, and the 'evidence base' weak. Evidence is not systematically collected across the Member States; however, some initiatives and programmes are evaluated locally and nationally, and labour market integration monitoring does take place at the macroeconomic level.

**A commitment to field experiments-
Ministry of Social Affairs and Employment,
the Netherlands (2018-2021, €10 million)**

In its drive to improve the labour market position of refugees and migrants, the Dutch Ministry of Social Affairs and Employment has launched eight pilot projects, which are experimenting with new approaches to tackle the persistent issues of non-western migrants' higher unemployment rates, higher benefit dependency and lower incomes when compared with the native population. The pilots are aimed at finding new ways to tackle barriers to inclusion, and focus on issues such as addressing pre-entry discrimination, providing intensive coaching for vulnerable groups and increasing parental involvement in study choices for pre-vocational students. The Ministry is committed to bringing together partners such as municipalities and employers to co-create such experiments with a focus on monitoring, evaluating, including measuring, effectiveness, and in time to be able to demonstrate a macroeconomic impact.

¹⁸ Pennix, M. (2019), Integration of migrants in the labour markets of EU Member States: a review of research and its lessons for policy.

Inclusion takes place at the level of the individual, family and community, and thus is highly location specific. It is also a process which takes place over time, and thus the impacts of interventions may demonstrate user satisfaction, but fail to provide sufficient evidence to show that longer-term goals are also being achieved. This creates a number of challenges for effective evaluation and also for information sharing across localities. Measures that are implemented at the local level and adapted to very specific local situations as well as within varying local, regional and national employment policies and welfare regimes, may be challenging to transmit at national level, and across the Member States. Policy-makers must assess whether a successful intervention from another locality, region or country can be sufficiently adapted to work effectively in their specific context.

Inclusion as a research / evaluation topic is best approached as a two-way process between migrants and the host society, with three interacting dimensions, i.e. legal/political; socio-economic; cultural / religious; and at three levels, i.e. individual; group; and institutional. Combined into an analytical (heuristic) tool, these approaches can be very useful to policymakers and practitioners in forming the basis of evidence for what factors contribute to long-term inclusion processes for specific groups, in particular localities at specific points in time.

To be effective, evaluation methods must use appropriate indicators and result in objective evidence-based findings from which credible conclusions can be drawn to underpin recommendations for future actions.

Trails to assess impacts – The Social Impact Bond, Finland (2016-2019, €14 million)

The “Integration Social Impact Bond” (SIB) is a new approach adopted in Finland to support the inclusion of migrants. The Integration SIB is an impact investing model, where private and institutional investors finance a trial. Migrants are selected for the trial by random sampling: 70% are allocated to the trial and 30% are allocated to a control group (where migrants go through the standard path of integration training and other employment services).

After the trial, the Ministry of Economic Affairs and Employment will commission an external evaluation, where taxes paid and unemployment benefits received by those who participated in the SIB project, will be compared to the taxes paid and unemployment benefits received by the control group. From the State’s perspective, the experiment will be deemed a success if the taxes paid by those participating in the experiment are higher and unemployment benefits received are lower than in the control group.

Mechanisms to identify good practices can be subjective; therefore, if good practices are to be shared effectively, they must be justified by robust research or evaluation evidence. Success factors include the objectivity of the evaluators and engagement with all key stakeholders, including the migrants themselves. Output and outcome focused evaluations, drawing on the experiences of participants can provide good levels of evidence for good practices and their effectiveness for target groups; however, process evaluations, which examine implementation over time, are most effective in understanding how change can best be implemented as well as support the identification of models that can be shared.

Assessing and sharing promising practices – Fast Track Action Boost (FAB), Austria, Germany, Italy, Serbia, Spain and Sweden (2018-2020, €2.5 million)

The “Fast Track Action Boost” (FAB) project supports fast-track inclusion of refugees into the labour market in Milan, Berlin, Vienna, Stockholm, Madrid and cities in Serbia. FAB has set up a peer mentoring system among five urban areas across Europe, enabling the partners to exchange, adapt and transfer some of the most interesting experiences concerning fast-track inclusion of refugees in the labour market. Milan, Berlin, Vienna, Stockholm and Belgrade will be exchanging adapting and monitoring each other’s practices, while Madrid will have an observer role. This will lead to the creation of a “catalogue of good practices” proven to be replicable and adaptable. By 2021, the project will directly reach around 350 refugees, 150 experts and up to minimum 60 organisations in 10 countries via transnational activities.

Even where evaluation evidence is strong, challenges remain in transferring good practices due to differences in legal and political systems across Member States. A number of infrastructures and tools are available at EU level to facilitate this process, for example, the 11 'Common Basic Principles'¹⁹ and the Zaragoza indicators,²⁰ which serve as a common set of indicators in four policy areas (employment, education, social inclusion and active citizenship) as well as the Public Employment Services Knowledge Centre²¹ and the EU integration website.²² Additional awareness-raising and support to the Member States could improve the use of these tools.

For good practices to be harnessed and used in the process of policy-making, the length of funding cycles should be taken into account, especially when dealing with the complexity of inclusion and the time periods required for impact to be felt. This applies both to national as well as EU funding cycles.

4.2. Sustainable labour market inclusion initiatives

Sustainable employment allows migrants to utilise their skills and qualifications, to improve their language and work-related competences and to be financially self-reliant.

In general, flexible and targeted interventions tailor-made to migrants' different needs and skills (e.g. low-skilled versus high-skilled migrants) can support effective and sustainable inclusion measures. In recent years, targeted approaches, such as in Germany or Sweden,²³ have aimed to facilitate a more rapid labour market integration of some groups and focus additional support on more vulnerable groups. Depending on various national factors, this can either be project-based or via mainstreamed approaches that remain flexible to diverse needs, both requiring commitment to multi-stakeholder approaches across the public, private and civil society sector.

The skills and qualifications of migrants are often not adequately utilised: in 2017, 34% of tertiary-educated, foreign-born workers worked in low- or medium-skilled jobs.²⁴ In order to make better use of their potential, procedures for skills assessment (in foreign languages) and the recognition of foreign qualifications need to be further developed to facilitate better job matching based on skills, qualifications and preferences. This in turn can avoid a quick return to unemployment and improve career management skills, but also requires the collaboration and commitment of several labour market actors, such as employment services, training providers, education authorities and employers.

Skills and language training are key factors for the inclusion of migrants into the labour market. However, rather than setting competence in the host language as a pre-condition for training and inclusion support, language training can be combined with other support measures to help migrants to find employment quickly, such as illustrated in the example below.

Providing tailored training - Orientation to Finnish Society in migrants' your own language, Finland (2016-2019, € 250 000)

The training "Orientation to Finnish Society in migrants' your own language" has been developed originally in the Helsinki region to support migrants from different communities and it is currently being scaled up at the national level. Newly arrived migrants take part in a five-week inclusion training which provides information about services and the Finnish labour market, personal guidance, job search and cultural orientation and is held in English, Arabic, Persian, Dari and Russian. 12.9% of participants were in employment three months after the service was provided, compared to 6.3% who took part in the standard integration training offered only in English and Finnish.

The involvement of employers is crucial for sustainable labour market integration of migrants, for example, in the development of skills assessment

19 Common Basic Principles for Immigrant Integration policy in the EU, adopted by the Justice and Home Affairs Council in November 2004.

20 Declaration of the European Ministerial Conference on Integration (Zaragoza, 16 and 16 April 2010).

21 <https://ec.europa.eu/social/main.jsp?catId=1163&langId=en>

22 <https://ec.europa.eu/migrant-integration/>

23 For more information, see here: <https://ec.europa.eu/social/main.jsp?langId=en&catId=1274&newsId=9009&furtherNews=yes>

24 OECD and EU (2018) Settling In - Indicators of immigrant integration.

measures (often also done at the work place), combining measures to match migrants to sectors facing skills shortages (such as the Swedish fast tracks), but also in providing additional on-the-job support (via up-skilling training, workplace and language mentors etc.) for low-skilled migrants. A strong engagement with employers to recognise the skills of migrants without fluent host-country language skills is also shown in the example below.

Involving the private sector – Entry Hub Model, Sweden (2018–2021, €2 million)

The “Entry Hub” enables direct and local meetings between jobseekers and employers with the aim of continuous interaction and the validation of skills. For example, an Entry Hub was organised to recruit refugees for the employer ‘Postnord’ who needed part-time employees to sort parcels. After this, entry hub had taken place, 25 migrants who were initially not fluent in Swedish received a job offer. After four months they spoke Swedish fluently and 21 of them were still in this employment after a year.

Demographic and technological developments are changing European labour markets and migrants are increasingly likely to work in automated jobs (depending on their educational attainment) with fixed-term contracts²⁵. Therefore, labour market inclusion measures for migrants need to be better linked with policy measures to meet the needs of future labour markets. These could include holistic policies for forecasting future skills needs, support for career transitions to meet future labour market needs, and life-long learning, but also support for community-led approaches. Start-ups and social enterprises for example, may have the potential to develop more flexible, not bureaucratic, local solutions and social businesses with their social aims and participatory approach may also offer more inclusive work environments for vulnerable groups.

4.3. Education and skills for the inclusion of migrants

Key obstacles faced by refugees and asylum seekers (when they are allowed to work in the host country) are the lack of language skills as well as the difficulty to have their skills and qualifica-

tions recognised and validated, especially due to the absence of documentary evidence.²⁶ Specifically designed to bring adults back to education and training, upskilling mechanisms may improve education outcomes for adult migrants and may be an essential step to their labour market participation in the short or mid-term. However, upskilling mechanisms are most effective when tailored to the needs of asylum seekers and refugees and possibly matched with tailored learning pathways.

Auditing skills and competences - Acceleration of labour market integration of immigrants through mapping of skills and trainings (ALMIT), Bulgaria (2018–2020 €1.2 million)

The “ALMIT project” in Bulgaria focuses on screening of abilities and attitudes towards civic integration, supports profiling migrants’ skills and competences and organisation of multilingual language trainings. Development of intercultural course materials, train-the-trainer handbooks and e-learning platforms is also planned by 2020. The project will raise awareness to address discriminatory practices and violence, in particular against women.

Diverse and innovative practices to ensure access to education for asylum seekers, refugees and low-skilled migrants have been developed across Europe with the active support of the EU. Early intervention with short- and longer-term perspectives is important for an individual to be able to plan a possible career path based on pre-existing skills and to potentially supplement existing qualifications with missing or new ones. Although upskilling mechanisms can be most effective when implemented as soon as possible in the inclusion process (i.e. when asylum seekers are still in the asylum procedure), in order to rapidly map or validate skills, a long-term perspective must be considered too. This will allow the migrants to look ahead to the future and to take an informed decision on their professional inclusion rather than make a short-term oriented decision that may limit future education or work opportunities.

On a practical level, it is often the case that migrants receive a partial recognition of their qualifications. In this type of situation, it is necessary

²⁵ Biagi et al. (2018) Migrant workers and the digital transformation in the EU.

²⁶ European Commission/EACEA/Eurydice, 2019. Integrating Asylum Seekers and Refugees into Higher Education in Europe: National Policies and Measures. Eurydice Report. Luxembourg. Available at https://eacea.ec.europa.eu/national-policies/eurydice/sites/eurydice/files/232_en_migrants_he.pdf

to foresee actions (counselling, training, etc.) that allow to achieve full recognition of professional credentials. Some countries (Germany, for example) have witnessed that for a successful recognition of qualifications it is equally important to provide complementary support to enhance the qualification (i.e. through both classroom and on-line training, language classes and coaching etc.)

Empowerment of and coordination between various stakeholders is an important element in the successful inclusion of migrants into the labour market. The cooperation of multiple actors must work at different levels, including local authorities and employers, for instance through partnerships with private companies as presented in the example below.

Building public-private partnership for migrants' upskilling – LABOUR-INT, Belgium (2016-2018, €56 000)

As a result of extensive inter-institutional collaboration, "LABOUR-INT" helped asylum seekers to take their first tests to be able to access VET training, hold training of basic skills (e.g. language, maths, administration) and seek contacts with employers. This effort required a multi-stakeholder approach and currently LABOUR-INT promotes closer cooperation between public and private businesses, chambers of commerce and industries, trade unions and migrants' associations by exchanging objectives, methods and practices of labour market integration of migrants.

Some countries have introduced dual systems as they have proved effective in responding to different training needs (short/long-term) or blending together training and work. The dual approach allows a combination of basic skills and vocational trainings, vocational trainings organised within companies, or language training and employment. In some countries (e.g. Denmark) vocational training programmes can accommodate migrants with different levels of language skills by providing tailored courses, local language courses as well as basic skills (e.g. English and ICT).

Personalised and tailored upskilling pathways are needed to respond to the diverse needs of migrants, while taking into account psychological factors, especially when paired with mentoring. Flexible upskilling may provide literacy and basic

skills for the low-skilled migrants as well as informal and non-verbal skills for all migrants in order to better prepare them for integration to the labour market. It is also important to map the skills that migrants hold and to have an initial overview of skills which may be informal or not necessarily lead to formal recognition. An example of personalised upskilling is presented below.

Building upskilling pathways – SERN transnational network, Italy (2017-2019, €150 000)

The "SERN network" targeted the individual needs of migrants and refugees in the Parma region which proved to be effective for moving towards employment.

As an initial step, a local NGO in Parma organised a language course which at a later stage was supplemented with psychological training provided by a local theatre. Finally, a manufacturing company joined the initiative to map the skills of the participants. The language and psychological training proved to be very effective and helped migrants to successfully integrate among other company employees. As a result, the new employees were offered long-term employment contracts.

Finally, developing upskilling mechanisms within the integrated approach helps to ensure that migrants have the possibility to access, from their arrival, support in the area of education and vocational training. As a result, the labour market will benefit from the existing skills of potential new workers whilst on the other hand, migrant workers will become equipped with the necessary skills to fit the needs of European economies.

4.4. Social inclusion of the most vulnerable migrants

The unprecedented influx of migrants to Europe obliged Member States to revise their inclusion policies and measures to meet the immediate needs of large numbers of new-comers, while at the same time, to design pathways leading to their sustainable inclusion into society and the labour market. Furthermore, these new inclusion measures had to take into account the specific vulnerabilities of some of the newly-arrived migrants.

The Commission has provided a broad definition of vulnerable persons,²⁷ however vulnerability is a fluid and transitory status. The vulnerability of migrants stems from various factors at the individual level, such as their age, gender, disabilities or health status, plus the experiences that they left behind in their country of origin or encountered during their travel. It is also affected by the situation of their household and community, and sudden and unforeseen changes in any of these elements can have a significant impact on the vulnerability of a person or a group.

For instance, on their arrival in the EU, refugee women may suffer from multiple vulnerabilities associated with poorer health, lower education and prospects for labour market outcomes when compared with refugee men, who are already disadvantaged in comparison with other migrant groups.²⁸ However, research shows that, despite a difficult start, refugee women do manage to improve their employment situation and catch up, over the years, with their national female peers.²⁹ Therefore, coordinated early interventions should tackle the causes fuelling vulnerabilities from day one, thus avoiding lasting consequences on the inclusion process.

Supporting gender oriented counselling – Fostering Opportunities of Refugees Workers, Italy (2017-2019, €2.9 million)

The ESF funded project “Fostering Opportunities of Refugees Workers” in Italy outlines a new national model of inclusion which offers professional language and skills assessments combined with gender-oriented counselling in order to develop an individualised inclusion plan for asylum seekers. Services, provided by the local PES, are available already at refugee reception centres. 600 participants are expected to take part in the initiative, while another 600 will receive the standard support and act as a control group to assess the impact of the project through a counterfactual evaluation approach.

Similarly, unaccompanied minors (UAMs) are extremely vulnerable at their arrival as, for instance, they are at risk of falling into the hands of abusive adults, including smugglers. While all Member States provide housing, education and health services to unaccompanied minors, regardless of their status, once they come of age, these protections might cease, potentially leaving young people without a defined status and thus without clear pathways for inclusion. Measures should be designed to support migrants not only at their arrival, but they should map potential risk throughout the inclusion process.

Accompanying young migrants to their future – Percorsi, Italy (2016-2019, €11.6 million)

“Percorsi” (Pathways) is a programme of the Italian Ministry of Labour co-funded by ESF to accompany the transition to adulthood of UAMs and young migrants so that they effectively access the labour market and achieve self-sufficiency. Since 65% of UAMs are aged 16-17 years old when they reach Europe, Percorsi aims at designing an individual inclusion plan for each young migrant and, after a personalised needs assessment, supporting them in their job search through counselling and tutoring as well as individual job-orientation sessions.

The programme also provides a grant to support them in their inclusion path. Part of the grants is given directly to the young migrants to cover their expenses, while the rest is paid to enterprises that will offer them a five-month traineeship. Since 2016, almost 2 000 young migrants have been included in the programme. In 2019, Percorsi will be merged with an equivalent programme for adults in order to streamline processes and merge resources from different funds. The new project will be called PUOI 2019 and aims at offering over 4 500 traineeships.

27 In the Directive 2013/33eU of the 26 June 2013, laying down standards for the reception of applications for internal protection, Article 21 provide a broad definition of vulnerable persons such as “minors, unaccompanied minors, disabled people, elderly people, pregnant women, single parents with minor children, victims of human trafficking, persons with serious illnesses, persons with mental disorders and persons who have been subjected to torture, rape or other serious forms of psychological, physical or sexual violence, such as victims of female genital mutilation”. <https://eur-lex.europa.eu/legal-content/EN/TXT/HTML/?uri=CELEX:32013L0033&from=EN>

28 OECD and EU (2018), Settling In - Indicators of immigrant integration.

29 T. Li and K.R. Tronstad (2018). Triple Disadvantage? A first overview of the integration of refugee women. OECD Social, Employment and Migration Working Papers No. 216.

Given that migrants, and especially vulnerable migrants, are not a homogeneous group, measures, actions and projects should be based on individual needs assessments which will lead to individual solutions. Attention to individual needs does not mean a rejection of the mainstream approach over more targeted measures. It means that all services should be people-centred for final-users.

As migrants often lose their social network of support when arrive to their host country, they risk becoming disconnected from society, unaware of existing services and opportunities. Therefore activities that involve vulnerable groups and support them in establishing meaningful ties with their host society are particularly crucial, especially for women without a job.

Creating new connections in the host country - The Mentor Network, Denmark (since 2017)

The “Mentor Network” is a programme run by KVINFO to facilitate the inclusion of migrant and refugee women into both the Danish labour market and society at large.

KVINFO matches women that are well-established in the Danish labour market and society with migrant women who need support. The connection is made based on a similar educational or vocational background, a similar profession or on personal ambitions. Mentors are all volunteers and offer about two hours a month over the course of 4-12 months to engage with mentees on issues they have agreed to work on together. Since 2002, the programme has counted more than 7 500 participants.

An evaluation carried out between 2010 and 2014 suggests that 38% of “mentees” found a job after being part of the initiatives, and most report they have become more active in Danish society and fluent in the Danish language thanks to the programme. Running this initiative is not expensive, however, it requires a strong organisation and follow-up.

Targeted and mainstream inclusion policies and services for migrants cannot only be tailored to pre-defined categories of vulnerable people, they should be developed keeping at the centre the

individuals who will be their end users. However, this approach can put a strain on local administrations’ and services providers’ already stretched resources whereby local authorities, which are often at the forefront of the inclusion of the most vulnerable migrants, are not always equipped with the necessary skills to ensure equal access to the same service for all.³⁰ Programmes to strengthen the capacities of local administrations to provide adequate, coherent and people-centred services to migrants can prove effective in such cases.

In addition, while several EU-funded initiatives have been put in place to provide services to vulnerable migrants, in some cases, there has been a need to improve cooperation and partnership working among the various inclusion actors. In particular, where local administration staff are involved fully in the coordination of these services, this can help to ensure sustainability once projects are over.

Building capacity of local administrations - Admin4All, Austria, Italy, Romania, Poland (2018-2020, €1 million)

“ADMin4ALL- Supporting Active Inclusion of Disadvantaged Migrants” is an IOM programme co-funded by the EU aiming at strengthening the capacity of local social service providers in 14 cities which are part of a transnational network across four countries.

Through a series of trainings and peer mentoring activities, the initiative is reinforcing municipal administrations, with particular attention to their front-line staff, in dealing with the multiple dimensions of long-term socio-economic inclusion of migrants and refugees at the local level. Since 2017, the programme has engaged over 500 staff with training and mutual learning events. The initiative will be expanded to three additional countries and 20 more cities.

³⁰ EU, OECD (2018), Working Together for Local Integration of Migrants and Refugees.



Finally, on top of inclusion pathways, migrants and especially vulnerable migrants benefit from opportunities to become more empowered in the process of inclusion itself. This positive engagement can strengthen their resilience and allow them to become active members of their new communities (as shown in the WIR project). New innovative

initiatives, based on co-production principles, are being piloted to involve migrants, and especially vulnerable ones, in the design and provision of services for their peers and -in time- also for other users. However, this approach requires time as the involvement and empowerment of vulnerable groups is a long-term process.





5. CONCLUSION AND KEY POLICY MESSAGES³¹

5.1. Lessons learnt and conclusions

In the past years, Member States have developed policies to promote and support the effective inclusion of migrants into their labour market and society, in line with the EU policy framework, whilst making use of the EU funding tools and instruments to support cooperation on inclusion. However, the potential of available EU support has not been exhausted and the inclusion of migrants remains salient notably because of the ongoing and diverse migration flows to the EU as well as the changing economic and social needs across the EU.

There is a need to strengthen evidence-based approaches to ensure a better understanding of the measures implemented and their impact on the inclusion outcomes of migrants. Initiatives are being implemented that include blind trials and counterfactual impact evaluations as a way to compare the advantages of new measures vis-à-vis mainstream ones. While these exercises can provide a short-term assessment of a measure, a more structured approach to evaluating the overall effectiveness and impact of inclusion policies is

also required. National macro-economic analysis as well as comparative studies covering multiple countries (such as those produced by the OECD) can offer useful insights to steer strategic and long-term policy-making.

Moreover, mainstreaming policies and services to cater to the need of all people should remain the preferred approach to ensure that migrants are not relegated to a separate track when it comes to labour market integration. However, tailored support is needed to overcome vulnerabilities of specific categories of migrants such as women and minors as well as low-skilled migrants who are not coming to Europe in the framework of an employment programme. Early measures including assessment of personal needs and skills as well as the creation of individual work plans are essential to improve the labour market outcomes of migrants.

Tailored solutions are also needed when designing pathways for migrant inclusion. Upskilling practices are progressively focussing on offering individual plans, blending them with mentoring and tutoring services. However, it is important that

³¹ This report, including Lessons learnt and Key policy messages stem from a Mutual Learning Conference on “Sustainable inclusion of migrants into society and labour market” organized by the Directorate-General for Employment, Social Affairs and Inclusion of the European Commission in cooperation with the Social Protection Committee (SPC), the Employment Committee (EMCO) and Member States’ authorities on 12 April 2019 in Brussels.

upskilling policies take into account both larger systemic changes in the labour market such as job-digitalisation so that today's inclusion will not mean tomorrow's exclusion.

Finally, to make better use of EU funds, it is crucial to mainstream inclusion across policy sectors beyond the local level and foster stronger and meaningful cooperation among various key inclusion actors, including employers, civil society organisations, public authorities, education and training providers. For instance, innovative approaches building on civil society organisations' and on private actors' experiences to integrate migrants could be explored such as mentorship and targeted vocational language training. Speeding up and facilitating inclusion remains a shared responsibility whereas flexible access to EU support available to each inclusion actor could be enhanced.

5.2. Key policy messages

How best to develop integrated approaches to actively include migrants in the labour market and society:

- Adopt dynamic and long-term inclusion policies and pathways by keeping at pace with labour market developments and taking into account work transformations (such as digitalisation and the gig economy as inclusion policies should be "future-proof", i.e. consistent with forthcoming opportunities) as well as relying on strengthened social protection measures.
- Ensure that the integrated approach towards inclusion of migrants takes into account the high variety in migrants' profiles and labour market structures and conditions across the Member States.
- Ensure an overall effective coordination among stakeholders at various levels to avoid duplication and achieve complementarity of inclusion support.
- Engage and build innovative partnerships with non-governmental stakeholders to complement existing services and establish overall conditions conducive to social inclusion.
- Create an enabling environment for migrant inclusion by providing a robust and stable legal framework alongside long-term funding commitments. Uncertainty and changes delay the inclusion process and might create mistrust towards authorities.

- Support early inclusion measures and programmes for migrants to maximise success in achieving their future inclusion.
- Work towards a multi-stakeholder approach backed by strong political commitment.
- Involve migrants in designing and implementing services to empower them and encourage them to become active members of society.

How to improve EU policies and better target funding to achieve sustainable inclusion:

- Provide support and incentives for Member States to actively promote exchanges of tested practices and measures. This can be done for example by relying on existing European platforms (such as Eurocities or EaSI-funded initiatives) and tools to further disseminate local initiatives.
- Increase flexibility in the use of EU funding instruments at Member States' disposal and facilitate access to funding for local and regional authorities as well as NGOs as they are at the forefront of the inclusion process and fundamental in providing services for migrants.
- Support Member States in informing citizens perception vis-à-vis migrant inclusion so that it is perceived as an investment and an advantage for all.
- Encourage managing authorities to build synergies among funding in order to simplify pooling resources and coordinate inclusion measures more effectively.

How to develop evidence-based policies supporting migrant inclusion in society and the labour market:

- Conduct comprehensive evaluations of existing policies and projects to identify, disseminate and scale-up measures fostering migrant inclusion as well as to contribute to national evidence-based strategies.
- Review critically promising practices also engaging external evaluators to ensure that initiatives are impartially assessed through robust methodologies, including objective indicators.

- Involve all stakeholders as well as migrants themselves in the evaluation process to ensure that it offers all-round understanding of the various elements that contributed to the success of the measures assessed. Interconnections with and dependence on other initiatives should also be taken in consideration to support transferability.
- Define a clear baseline and plan for evaluation exercises to allow the assessment to capture the length and complexity of the inclusion process and understanding what measures can influence it positively.
- Strengthen the monitoring of migrant inclusion through the European Semester, including by focusing on inclusion outcomes

Labour market integration: how to create sustainable and quality employment opportunities:

- Foster early and fast labour market integration of migrants as a crucial element for their inclusion as it allows them to become financially independent and self-reliant; utilise their skills and qualifications; practice their language skills; and build up social networks.
- Mainstreaming measures should be the preferred approach as they can better contribute to the sustainable inclusion of migrants into the labour market on the long run.
- Implement individualised and targeted approaches that capture migrants' different needs and skills (e.g. low-skilled versus high-skilled migrants). Taking into consideration such differences is a key ingredient for effective and sustainable inclusion measures.
- Actors such as employers, civil society, education and training institutes as well as Public Employment Services should be involved in the design implementation and evaluation of labour market integration measures.
- Support employers' engagement through government funding, as they are crucial for the sustainable labour market integration of migrants.
- Pair the support to innovative approaches such as start-ups and social enterprises with rigorous evaluations to assess their added value and, eventually, the scalability of these models.

How to improve education outcomes and skills of migrants

- Ensure access to education for migrants through early intervention measures that take into account short and longer-term perspectives. Priority could be given to low-skilled migrants and groups at risk of exclusion.
- Prioritise dual systems that combine language courses with training or employment pathways, that require migrants to know the language before accessing the labour market.
- Flexible training and education practices should take into account individuals' psychological needs.
- Further develop flexible upskilling pathways and career management processes that are accessible for migrants to foster sustainable inclusion. Migrants, like all workers, need the tools to improve their skills further and meet the needs of the changing labour market.
- Design education and training programmes that minimise the risk of drop out by providing adequate support, mentoring and follow up. Particular attention should be given to reaching out to vulnerable groups, besides training premises should be easily accessible for the participants.
- Encourage cooperation and coordination among stakeholders that are involved in migrants' skills development and assessment and enable them to use the right tools to do so. Such cooperation is essential to match people with a certain qualification- or skillset with the right jobs. In this regard, employers should be closely involved as well as Public Employment Services. The latter should have a more active role in the inclusion process where trust is a very important factor.



How to ensure social inclusion of the most vulnerable migrants

- Adjust inclusion policies to cater to the needs of the most vulnerable migrants: both targeted and mainstream measures should have the 'end user' in mind. Ideally, vulnerability should be assessed individually also taking into account multiple vulnerabilities.
- Design needs-based services for all migrants instead of building parallel services for vulnerable groups.
- Weave targeted outreach programmes in the mainstream inclusion measures to support migrants who are more vulnerable or at risk of exclusion.
- Provide additional support to service providers at the local level which are at the front line of inclusion of the most vulnerable migrants.
- Design inclusion programmes that support vulnerable migrants to build up a social network as a means to improve their outcomes of integration into the labour market.



Getting in touch with the EU

In person

All over the European Union there are hundreds of Europe Direct Information Centres. You can find the address of the centre nearest you at: <http://europa.eu/contact>

On the phone or by e-mail

Europe Direct is a service that answers your questions about the European Union. You can contact this service

- by freephone: 00 800 6 7 8 9 10 11 (certain operators may charge for these calls),
- at the following standard number: +32 22999696 or
- by electronic mail via: <http://europa.eu/contact>

Finding information about the EU

Online

Information about the European Union in all the official languages of the EU is available on the Europa website at: <http://europa.eu>

EU Publications

You can download or order free and priced EU publications from EU Bookshop at: <http://bookshop.europa.eu>. Multiple copies of free publications may be obtained by contacting Europe Direct or your local information centre (see <http://europa.eu/contact>)

EU law and related documents

For access to legal information from the EU, including all EU law since 1951 in all the official language versions, go to EUR-Lex at: <http://eur-lex.europa.eu>

Open data from the EU

The EU Open Data Portal (<http://data.europa.eu/euodp/en/data>) provides access to datasets from the EU. Data can be downloaded and reused for free, both for commercial and non-commercial purposes.

This report stems from a Mutual Learning Conference on ‘Sustainable inclusion of migrants into society and labour market’ organized by the European Commission in cooperation with the Social Protection Committee (SPC), the Employment Committee (EMCO) and Member States’ authorities on 12 April 2019 in Brussels. The Conference brought together around 125 participants consisting of Member States representatives as well as representatives from the European Commission, social partners, academics and civil society. It gave insights into a number of areas and contributed to a better understanding of existing and future challenges in this field, including related possible solutions. The aim was to provide an overview of current policy programs, initiatives and practices related to the inclusion of migrants in European labour markets and societies. Discussions focused in particular on how integrated approaches towards migrants’ inclusion can be instrumental for Member States as well as on reinforcing synergies between national and EU funding opportunities.

